Looting Hoards of Gold & Poaching Spotted Owls: Data Confidentiality Among Archaeologists & Zoologists

Rebecca D. Frank
University of Michigan
frankrd@umich.edu
@frankrd

Adam Kriesberg, Ph.D.
University of Maryland
akriesbe@umd.edu

Elizabeth Yakel, Ph.D.
University of Michigan
yakel@umich.edu

Ixchel Faniel, Ph.D.
OCLC Research
fanieli@oclc.org
• An Institute for Museum and Library Services (IMLS)-funded project led by Dr. Ixchel Faniel and Dr. Elizabeth Yakel.

• Studying data reuse in three academic disciplines to identify how contextual information about the data that supports reuse can best be created and preserved.

• Focuses on research data produced and used by quantitative social scientists, archaeologists, and zoologists.

• Intended audiences: researchers who use secondary data and the digital curators, digital repository managers, data center staff, and others who collect, manage, and store digital information.

http://dipir.org/ @DIPIR_Project
Introduction
Overview

Introduction
Methods overview
Research questions
Data collection & analysis
Findings
Discussion
Issues for Repositories

Data: Artifacts, Specimens, and Location Information
Data Confidentiality: Sharing or Restricting Access to Location Information
Views About the Effectiveness of Restrictions on Sensitive Data
Data Management Responsibility
## Methods Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Open Context Archaeology</th>
<th>UMMZ Zoology</th>
<th>ICPSR Social Science</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phase 1: Project Start-Up (2011)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews: Staff</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase 2: Collecting and Analyzing User Data (2012 - 2013)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web Analytics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>server logs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Collection & Analysis

Data Collection
- 22 interviews with archaeologists
- 40 interviews & observations with zoologists

Data Analysis
- Confidentiality
- Legal issues
- Ethics & values
- Funding agency mandates
Research Questions

How do perceptions of risk or potential harm influence attitudes about data confidentiality among archaeologists and zoologists?

How do perceptions of risk or potential harm influence attitudes about who should take responsibility for managing issues of data confidentiality among archaeologists and zoologists?
Data: Artifacts, Specimens, and Location Information

“Information about the age and the location in a particular stratigraphy where you find a specimen, the location of the spot where the specimen came from, and the taxonomic information about the assessment.” (Zoologist07)

http://www.flickr.com/photos/curiousexpeditions/870691270/
Data Confidentiality: Sharing or Restricting Access to Location Information

“We have very precise locational data that we don't want the general public to access because we're afraid of the potential looters and hunters” (Archaeologist02)

CC BY-SA 2.0
https://www.flickr.com/photos/gbaku/2452254355/
Views About the Effectiveness of Restrictions on Sensitive Data

“If you have data on all the nests of spotted owls of the Pacific Northwest, yeah, that data should not be queryable by the public. But that doesn't mean that if another scientist emails you and asks you for that data, that you should not give it to them.” (Zoologist11)

http://www.northernspottedowl.org/owlLocations/index.html
Views About the Effectiveness of Restrictions on Sensitive Data

"we really want people to know where the sites are because we believe that that protects them." (Archaeologist09)
Data Management Responsibility

“I’m going to pass the buck, so repositories need to figure it out… I wouldn’t want to be responsible for making these choices.” (Archaeologist06)

“Essentially, it’s not my responsibility to police who’s doing [what] with it.” (Zoologist19)
Discussion

Potential harms
Shifting disciplinary norms
Locus of responsibility
Issues for Repositories

Multiple, sometimes conflicting laws, rules, and ethical frameworks.

Sensitive data may be able to be inferred from other data points.

Identification of confidential data in past accessions may be difficult.

Developing systems, protocols and regimes that enable monitored reuse can be difficult and costly.
Acknowledgments

- Institute of Museum and Library Services LG-06-10-0140-10
- PI: Ixchel Faniel, Ph.D., OCLC Research
- Co-PI: Elizabeth Yakel, Ph.D., UMSI
- OCLC Diversity Fellow: Julianna Barrera-Gomez
- Research Fellow: Anthea Josias, Ph.D.
- Students: Morgan Daniels, Michele DeLia, Annelise Doll, Kathleen Fear, Molly Haig, Mallory Hood, Pearl Ko, Adam Kriesberg, Monique Lowe, Jessica Schaengold, Gavin Strassel.
Looting Hoards of Gold & Poaching Spotted Owls: Data Confidentiality Among Archaeologists & Zoologists

Rebecca D. Frank
frankrd@umich.edu
@frankrd
@DIPIR_Project